

**THE INFLUENCE OF COLLABORATIVE AND LEARNING STRATEGIES STUDY MOTIVATION ON LEARNING OUTCOMES ISLAMIC RELIGIOUS EDUCATION FOR SCHOOL STUDENTS COUNTRY BASIC 065015 MEDAN TUNTUNGAN**

Rusydi Ananda<sup>1</sup> Muhammad Rifai<sup>2</sup> Khozali Mar'i<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>Lecturer of PAI FITK UINSU

<sup>3</sup>PAI FITK UINSU Masters Students

**Abstract**

The objectives of this research were to find out: (1) the different effect between collaborative and competitive instructional strategy toward Islamic Education achievement, (2) the difference of the Islamic Education achievement between student with high learning motivation and low learning motivation, and (3) the interaction between instructional strategy and learning motivation toward Islamic Education achievement. The instrument used to measure the Islamic Education achievement was a multiple choice test. The instrument used to measure the students' learning motivation was questionnaire. The normality test used Liliefors and the homogeneity test was Fisher test and Bartlett test. The data analysis technique was Analysis of Variance with two-way at the level of significance  $\alpha = 0,05$  followed by Scheffe test. The research findings were: (1) on average the students' Islamic Education achievement taught with collaborative instructional strategy was  $\bar{X} = 28.14$  which was higher than the average the students' Islamic Education achievement taught with competitive instructional strategy, which was  $\bar{X} = 27.07$  with  $F_{\text{count}} = 35.08 > F_{\text{table}} = 3.96$ , (2) on average the student' Islamic Education achievement with high learning motivation was  $\bar{X} = 29.91$ , which was higher than the student' Islamic Education achievement with low learning motivation was  $\bar{X} = 26.05$  with  $F_{\text{count}} = 4.28 > F_{\text{table}} = 3.96$ , and (3) there was an interaction between instructional strategy and learning motivation toward Islamic Education achievement with  $F_{\text{count}} = 9,94 > F_{\text{table}} = 3.96$ .

**Keywords:** Collaborative And Learning Strategies, Learning Motivation

**Introduction**

The competencies that are expected to be obtained by students after studying Islamic Religious Education have not been achieved optimally. Competencies that have not been maximally achieved by students can be caused by various factors, including the difficulty of students understanding teaching materials and coupled with the inability of teachers to choose or design varied and appropriate learning strategies to attract students' interest. It also does not maximize the use of various learning media or learning formulations that do not focus on understanding that can demonstrate activities that can be seen, criticized, and improved.

In addition, the learning process that has not maximized the potential of students both physically and psychologically in order to absorb more information results in students being less and not motivated to learn. Though motivation is needed to generate student interest in learning. Santrock (2008:510) states that motivation is a process that gives enthusiasm, direction, and persistence of behavior.

One of the efforts that can be done to improve learning outcomes is to improve the quality of learning by implementing better learning strategies. Learning activities are the core of educational activities that cannot be separated from the role of the teacher. The ability of teachers to master learning design to plan, design, implement and evaluate as well as provide feedback is an important factor in achieving learning objectives. The ability of teachers to master learning materials, teaching styles, use of media, determining strategies and choosing learning methods is an effort to expedite the learning process and improve learning outcomes.

The right learning strategy to be applied is an option if you want learning to be effective and efficient, as revealed by Slameto (2005:65) so that students can learn well, the learning strategy is carried out effectively and efficiently. It is said to be effective if the learning strategy produces what is expected or in other words the goal is achieved. It is said to be efficient if the learning strategy applied uses relatively minimum energy, effort, cost and time.

There are various types of learning strategies that teachers can use in the classroom, including contextual strategies, cooperative strategies, collaborative strategies and so on. With collaborative learning, students who have learning difficulties can be helped by their friends. However, it should be realized that there is no best or worst strategy, because this strategy has advantages and disadvantages. In this case, Sudjana (2002:76) states that each method has advantages and disadvantages.

The learning strategies used by teachers so far have not been optimal so that it causes student boredom which results in low learning outcomes. To reduce or even avoid learning strategies that are too monotonous, various teaching strategies are sought that are more effective in creating multi-directional communication, so that it is hoped that it will also lead to and increase proactive interactions in learning Islamic Religious Education.

One of the strategies that can be applied by teachers in learning collaborative strategies. Collaborative learning strategy is group learning in which students learn through interaction with each other with fellow group members on the basis of a positive sense of interdependence, a sense of personal and group responsibility so that each student can maximize his potential both for his personal interests and for the interests of the group.

Gunawan (2004:87) states that there are five important elements that must exist in collaborative learning, namely: (1) positive independent (feelings of togetherness), (2) face-to-face interaction or face-to-face mutual support (helping each other, respecting each other, congratulating and celebrating mutual success), (3) individual and group responsibility for learning success, (4) interpersonal and small group communication skills (communication, trust,

leadership, decision making and management and conflict resolution), and ( 5) group processing (reflecting on their function and ability to work together as a group and how to be able to perform better.

The results of the study show the advantages of applying collaborative learning strategies in increasing student learning outcomes, including: (1) the results of Roqoiyah's research (2016) found that there was an increase in learning achievement of Islamic religious education through collaborative learning models in fifth grade students of SD Negeri Sukosongo in the 2015 academic year/ 2016, where the average learning achievement from cycle I was 62.54 to 81.67 in cycle II and the value of classical learning mastery was from 33.33% to 91.67%, (2) the results of Santoso's research (2013) show that there are the significant difference in the effectiveness of the collaborative learning model on physics learning outcomes compared to the lecture method. The average student learning outcomes using the collaborative learning model is 12,949 better than the lecture method, which is 10.949, so it can be said that the collaborative learning model applied in the learning process will result in an increase in student learning outcomes that are better than the lecture method, and (3) The results of Yenni's research (2015) show that student learning outcomes taught using a collaborative learning model are better than student learning outcomes taught using a quantum teaching learning model on tax material for class VIII SMPN 1 Makmur students.

The selection of the right learning strategy is absolutely necessary, however, the acquisition of student learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education is also influenced by the characteristics of the students themselves, namely learning motivation, for example in a collaborative learning process, a teacher should be able to know and understand the characteristics of students' learning motivation. By knowing the level of student learning motivation, a teacher can adjust, compile and create relevant teaching materials to assist and direct students' readiness to receive subject matter in collaborative learning and competitive learning.

Taking into account the characteristics of Islamic Religious Education learning above, the characteristic factors of learning motivation also influence the level of success in achieving learning success. As previously explained, there are differences in student characteristics that affect individual personality development, including learning motivation. Where students with high learning motivation characteristics are more likely to develop their learning success than students with low learning motivation characteristics.

Students with high learning motivation characteristics in Islamic Religious Education learning show a strong drive to be oriented towards achieving maximum Islamic Religious Education learning outcomes than students with low learning motivation characteristics. Students with low learning motivation have characteristics such as: pessimistic, passive, quiet, and difficult to adapt to other people. This kind of characteristic when given a collaborative strategy that emphasizes cooperation and interaction with other students has less influence on them. On the other hand, a competitive strategy will have a positive impact on those who have low learning motivation. Because it is more aloof and

difficult to get along with, the work done will be more effective when done alone than together with other people. Therefore, if this type is given a competitive strategy, it will have a better effect than a collaborative strategy.

The results showed that students' learning motivation was related to the achievement of learning outcomes, including: (1) the results of Santoso's (2013) research. The correlation coefficient of student learning motivation using collaborative learning models with physics learning outcomes was  $r = 0.805$  or  $R^2 = 0.648$ , which means that the effect of student learning motivation on physics learning outcomes is 64.8% and the rest is influenced by other factors, (2) the results of Sunadi's research (2015) show that learning motivation has a partially significant effect on learning achievement in Economics subjects in class XI IPS at SMA Muhammadiyah 2 Surabaya with a significance level of = 5%. This can be seen from the results of data analysis which shows the tcount value of 2.10 which is greater than ttable of 1.99 and (3) the results of research by Zulhafizh, Atmazaki, and Syahrul (2013) show that there is a positive and significant relationship between learning motivation and Indonesian language learning outcomes. In this case learning motivation contributes to learning outcomes of 11.3%.

### **Research Methods**

The population of this research was all students of Grade V SDN 065015 Medan Tuntungan District consisting of two classes. The sampling technique applied was cluster random sampling taught with collaborative instructional strategy and the students taught with competitive instructional strategy. The instrument used to measure the Islamic Education achievement was a multiple choice test. The instrument used to measure the students' learning motivation was questionnaire. The normality test used Liliefors and the homogeneity test was Fisher test and Bartlett test. The data analysis technique was Analysis of Variance with two-way at the level of significance  $\alpha = 0,05$  followed by Scheffe test.

### **Research Result and Discussion**

The results of this study have shown that the group of students at SDN 065015 Medan Tuntungan who were taught with collaborative learning strategies obtained higher Islamic Religious Education learning outcomes than the group of students who were taught with competitive learning strategies, where the average value of Islamic Religious Education learning outcomes was It was found that students of SDN 065015 Medan Tuntungan who were taught with collaborative learning strategies were higher than students taught by competitive learning strategies.

These findings indicate that to teach Islamic Religious Education material, it is more appropriate to use a collaborative learning strategy than a competitive strategy. The findings of this study support the results of research by Payong (2005) and Yuni (2001). Payong's research on the Effect of Collaborative and Competitive Learning Strategies and Learning Motivation on Civic Education Learning Outcomes of SMA 03 Jakarta Students found that

students who took learning with a collaborative strategy showed higher learning outcomes for Citizenship Education compared to students who participated in learning with a competitive strategy. For students who have high learning motivation, collaborative learning strategies have a high impact on learning outcomes compared to competitive strategies. However, for students who have low learning motivation, both collaborative strategies and competitive strategies do not have a different effect.

Yuni's research on the Influence of Collaborative Learning Strategies and Locus of Control on Physics Learning Outcomes at SMP 1 Pematang Siantar found that students who took lessons with collaborative learning strategies showed higher learning outcomes than students who took lessons with competitive strategies. Furthermore, when viewed from independent learning, there is no significant difference from the application of collaborative and competitive learning methods.

The first hypothesis states that the learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education among students of SDN 065015 Medan Tuntungan who were taught by collaborative learning strategies were higher than those of students who were taught by competitive learning strategies. This is understandable because through collaborative learning strategies can encourage students to be active in learning as explained by Jonassen (1996) that collaborative learning is a small group learning where students work together to maximize their own learning outcomes and the learning outcomes of other group members. The collaborative learning process is not just working together in a group but the emphasis is more on a learning process that involves a complete and fair communication process in the classroom.

Collaborative learning strategy aims to foster student participation in doing exercises proposed by the teacher in learning, foster discussion among students in finding causes and solutions to these issues or problems. Therefore, the teacher's role in collaborative learning is as a facilitator who directs students to discover and construct their own knowledge.

Collaborative learning strategy is a strategy in learning in the form of learning groups that work together. Therefore, in collaborative learning there is interaction, cooperation and mutual need among the members of the study group. The measure of success is determined based on the extent to which the learning group achieves the target. In this activity, cooperation, personal responsibility and mutually supportive interactions are needed because the success of the group is determined by the success of the individual members involved in it.

On the other hand, competitive learning strategies emphasize personal effort to achieve the goals that have been set. Interaction between fellow friends is very lacking and each individual is oriented towards achieving maximum results. The scoring and reward system becomes a reference to determine whether someone wins or loses in achieving the set targets.

Implementation of Islamic Religious Education learning by applying collaborative learning strategies, the teacher's role is to facilitate the division of study groups, provide group assignments which of course begin with exposure

to the important points of the teaching material. Then students interact in their groups and create positive interdependence among students, the division of work and responsibilities is well established.

The implementation of Islamic Religious Education learning by applying competitive learning strategies, the teacher's role is the main transmitter of teaching materials, then students are given individual assignments. During the learning process individually, students work to prepare their respective assignments. Therefore, there is less interaction between students and there is no division of labor, so that the results of student work are individual work. Therefore, smart students have no difficulty in completing these tasks, while slow students will of course have difficulty completing tasks.

Collaborative learning strategies are more likely to enable students to learn to understand the subject matter of Islamic Religious Education because it is carried out in a shared learning community among students. Students in collaborative learning activities can learn together to solve problems or complete tasks together, students who do not understand the subject matter of Islamic Religious Education can ask their friends who are more mastered. Whereas in competitive learning, students learn individually, therefore if students have difficulty solving problems or completing assignments, these students have their own difficulties because other students do not provide support or assistance.

The statement above is in line with Davis' (1993) study of collaborative strategies, namely: (1) students work in teams to master the subject matter, (2) teams or groups are formed varying from students who have high, medium, and low academic performance, (3) the team consists of members who vary in terms of gender, and race, and (4) the reward system is group-oriented, not individual, while Hill and Hill (1996) that there are two important elements that are always present in collaborative activities namely common goals and positive interdependence.

The findings of this study support and confirm the results of previous research conducted by Nurfiatin, Sunarto, Sudarno (2016) showing a collaborative learning model accompanied by a quantum teaching strategy can improve student learning outcomes in the subject of Marketing Strategy class X PM 1 SMK Negeri 6 Surakarta. This can be seen in the final student learning outcomes, the percentage of completeness is 46.67% or 14 students. In the first cycle the percentage of students' final learning outcomes increased by 70% or 21 students. Then in the second cycle there was an increase again in the final learning outcomes of students to 86.67% or 26 students.

The results of research by Lasidos and Matondang (2015) show that the application of collaborative learning can improve student activities and learning outcomes in subjects applying the basics of technical drawing. Where the average value of student learning activities in the first cycle is 68, increasing to 82 in the second cycle. Data on student learning outcomes in the first cycle obtained 16 students (80%) for the incompetent category and 4 students (20%) for the competent category. Cycle II obtained 16 students (80%) for the competent category and 4 students (20%) for the very competent category. The

average value of learning outcomes in the first cycle is 70, increasing to 85 in the second cycle.

The results of research by Azis, Adnan, Muis, Musawwir, and Faisal (2013) show that the applied collaborative learning has succeeded in increasing student learning activities. This is because, all stages of learning activities emphasize student involvement from the beginning to the end of learning.

The results of research by Rofiq, Widodo, Fajartanni (2014) show that student learning outcomes treated with collaborative learning models are higher than student learning outcomes treated with direct learning models in the subject of Reading Engineering Drawings. Where the calculation results show  $F_h = 7.26 > F_t(\alpha = 0.05) = 3.98$  and  $F_t(\alpha = 0.01) = 7.01$ . Where students who follow the collaborative learning model have an average learning outcome of 25.39 while those who follow the direct learning model have an average learning outcome of 20.61.

If it is further noted that in the collaborative learning strategy the average learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education students with learning motivation are higher than the learning outcomes of students with low learning motivation. While in the competitive learning strategy, the average learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education students with low learning motivation are higher than the results of Islamic Religious Education students with high learning motivation.

This shows that the ability of learning motivation is significant enough to distinguish student learning outcomes, where the learning outcomes of students with high learning motivation are more appropriate to be taught with collaborative learning strategies while students with low learning motivation abilities are more appropriately taught by competitive learning strategies.

Testing the second hypothesis shows that the learning outcomes of students with high learning motivation are higher than the learning outcomes of students with low learning motivation. These results prove that learning motivation is significant for differentiating the learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education. Learning motivation in this study is categorized into two categories, namely high and low.

The results of data analysis as a whole obtained that the average learning outcomes of students with high learning motivation were better than the learning outcomes of students with low learning motivation. This indicates that students with high learning motivation on average have better Islamic Religious Education learning outcomes than students with low learning motivation. Thus, students with high learning motivation understand and master the subject matter of Islamic Religious Education better than students with low learning motivation.

This is understandable because students with students with high learning motivation characteristics are generally those who are easy to get along with, active, optimistic, passionate, lively, enthusiastic, have high empathy, sympathy and persuasion. While the characteristics of low learning motivation have characteristics such as: difficult to get along, happy to be alone, indifferent, pessimistic, passive, quiet, and difficult to adapt to other people. Because of this

difference in the characteristics of learning motivation, it is predicted that it will have an influence on the achievement of student learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education.

Islamic Religious Education learning materials in the form of a set of knowledge, forms of skills and the cultivation of attitudes and values in the context of Islamic Religious Education disciplines. In addition, Islamic Religious Education learning is expected to develop thinking skills that can develop knowledge, skills and self-confidence. Likewise, the learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education are a description and level of cognitive ability in the form of knowledge and skills in the form of facts, concepts, procedures and principles.

Taking into account the characteristics of Islamic Religious Education learning above, the characteristics of learning motivation factors also influence the success rate of achieving the success of Islamic Religious Education learning. As previously explained, there are differences in student characteristics that affect individual personality development, including learning motivation. Where students with high learning motivation characteristics are more likely to develop their learning success than students with low learning motivation characteristics. Students with high learning motivation characteristics in learning Islamic Religious Education will show a strong drive to be oriented towards achieving maximum Islamic Religious Education learning achievement than students with low learning motivation characteristics.

The findings of this study support and confirm the results of previous research conducted by Warti (2016) which found there was a positive influence between students' learning motivation and students' mathematics learning outcomes. With the regression equation  $Y=a+bx=29.65 +0.605x$ . The correlation coefficient  $r = 0.974$  is significant at  $\alpha = 0.05$ .

The results of Sulisty's research (2016) showed an increase in student motivation and learning activities in the first, second and third cycles. In the first cycle, the students' learning motivation was 47%, the second cycle was 63% and the third cycle was 76%. Student learning activities in the first cycle are 32%, the second cycle is 53%, and the third cycle is 77% as a result of the implementation of learning strategies.

The results of Nurdin's research (2015) show that learning motivation has a relationship with learning achievement in civic education. The value of the coefficient of determination ( $R^2$ ) of 0.504 means that 50.4% of learning motivation has a relationship with learning achievement of civic education, while the remaining 49.6% (100% - 50.4%) is influenced by other factors. This can be seen from the results of data processing, the value of  $t_{count} = 7,933 > t_{table}$  value at 5% = 1,670.

The results of research by Hamdu and Agustina (2011) show that there is a significant influence between motivation on student achievement. This means that if students have motivation in learning, their learning achievement will be good (high). Conversely, if students have bad habits in learning, their learning achievement will be bad (low). The magnitude of the correlation coefficient ( $r$ ) is 0.693, which is greater than 0.491 with a significant level of 1%.



Testing the third hypothesis there is an interaction between learning strategies and learning motivation in influencing students' learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education. If we look at the average learning outcomes in groups of students with high learning motivation and being taught by collaborative strategies, it is better than the average learning outcomes for groups of students with high learning motivation and taught with competitive learning strategies.

The average learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education in groups of students with low learning motivation and being taught by collaborative strategies is lower than the average learning outcomes of groups of students with low learning motivation and taught by competitive strategies. This means that for groups of students with low learning motivation, it is better to use competitive learning strategies than using collaborative learning strategies. Thus, it can be concluded that learning strategies and learning motivation significantly affect students' learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education.

Collaborative learning strategies allow students to search and reconstruct information/knowledge by collaborating or collaborating with their classmates. Therefore, in collaborative learning, students interact with their environment in order to find the widest possible information. This is in line with the expression of Gunawan (2004: 197) that the advantages of collaborative learning are: training care, attention and willingness to share, increasing respect for others, training emotional intelligence, prioritizing group interests over personal interests, honing interpersonal intelligence, training skills work together, train the ability to listen to other people's opinions, conflict management, communication skills, students are not ashamed to ask their own friends, speed and learning outcomes increase, speed and learning outcomes increase rapidly, improve memory of the material studied, increase motivation and learning atmosphere .

While the weakness of collaborative learning is that students who are smarter if they do not understand the real purpose of the learning activity process, they feel disadvantaged because they have to bother helping their friends, smart students will also object because the value they get is determined by the achievements or achievements of their group. If cooperation cannot be carried out properly, only smart and active students will work.

The influence of collaborative and competitive strategies can have variations when viewed from the learning motivation of students. Students with high learning motivation are generally sociable, active, optimistic, passionate, lively, enthusiastic, have high empathy, sympathy and persuasion.

These characteristics are very suitable and develop well when the activities are carried out in groups. It means that the use of a collaborative strategy with students who are motivated to learn will provide more effective influence and results than the use of a competitive strategy. Thus, it can be assumed that the effect of a collaborative strategy on student learning outcomes with high learning motivation will be better than the use of a competitive strategy.

Therefore, there is a difference in the effect of collaborative and competitive strategies on the learning outcomes of students who are highly motivated to learn where collaborative strategies are thought to have a better effect than competitive strategies.

Students with low learning motivation have characteristics such as: difficult to get along with, likes to be alone, indifferent, pessimistic, passive, quiet, and difficult to adapt to other people. This kind of characteristic when given a collaborative strategy that emphasizes cooperation and interaction with other students has less influence on them.

On the other hand, a competitive strategy will have a positive impact on those who have low learning motivation. Because it is more aloof and difficult to get along with, the work done will be more effective when done alone than together with other people. Therefore, if this type is given a competitive strategy, it will have a better effect than a collaborative strategy. Thus, it is suspected that there are differences in the effect of collaborative strategies and competitive strategies on student learning outcomes, where students who are given a competitive strategy will be better at spurring the spirit of achievement and enthusiasm to compete with their classmates.

### **Conclusions and Recommendations**

The conclusions that can be drawn from the research findings are as follows:

1. The learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education students at SDN 065015 Medan Tuntungan who were taught with collaborative learning strategies were higher than the average learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education students at SDN 065015 Medan Tuntungan who were taught with competitive learning strategies. Thus the collaborative learning strategy is more effectively applied in learning Islamic Religious Education by providing an effective contribution of 15.05%.
2. The learning outcomes of Islamic Religious Education students at SDN 065015 Medan Tuntungan with high learning motivation were higher than the average Islamic Religious Education learning outcomes with low learning motivation by providing an effective contribution of 14.60%.
3. There is an interaction effect between learning strategies and learning motivation, where for students of SDN 065015 Medan Tuntungan with high learning motivation it is more appropriate to use collaborative learning strategies, while students with low learning motivations are more appropriate to use competitive learning strategies.

Based on the conclusions and implications of the research, the suggestions that can be conveyed are:

1. Principals should renew their learning activities by implementing collaborative learning strategies because through this research it is proven that collaborative learning strategies can improve learning outcomes.

2. To Islamic Religious Education teachers, it is necessary to look at the characteristics of students' learning motivation in implementing learning strategies. Where students with high learning motivation are more appropriate to use collaborative learning strategies and students with low learning motivations, competitive learning strategies should be used for Islamic Religious Education subjects.
3. To other researchers who want to research more about collaborative learning strategies and competitive learning strategies, they should add the controlled variables so that wider knowledge is obtained about collaborative learning strategies and competitive learning strategies.

### Literature

- Ananda, Rusydi dan Hayati, Fitri. *Variabel Belajar. Kompilasi Konsep*. Medan: Pusdikra, 2020.
- Azis, Andi Asmawati., Adnan, Muis, Abd., Musawwir, dan Faisal. *Penerapan Pembelajaran Kolaboratif Untuk Meningkatkan Aktivitas Belajar Siswa Kelas XU IPA 3 Melalui Lesson Study Berbasis Sekolah Di SMA Negeri 8 Makassar*. Jurnal: Bionature, Volume 14, Nomor 1, April 2013.
- Dimiyati dan Moedjiono. *Belajar dan Pembelajaran*, Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2003.
- Djamarah, Syaiful Bahri. dan Zain, Ahmad. *Strategi Belajar Mengajar*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2002.
- Djiwandono, Sri Esti Wuryani. *Psikologi Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Grasindo, 2008.
- Gunawan, Adi W. *Genius Learning Strategi*. Jakarta: Grasindo, 2004.
- Hamalik, Oemar. *Proses Belajar Mengajar*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2004.
- Lasidos, Pahala Arion dan Matondang, Zulkifli. *Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Kolaboratif Untuk Meningkatkan Aktivitas Dan Hasil Belajar Rencana Anggaran Biaya Siswa Kelas XII Kompetensi Keahlian Teknik Gambar Bangunan SMKN 2 Siatas Barita Tapanulis Utara*. Jurnal: Educational Building Volume 1, Nomor 1, Juni 2015. 13 – 22, ISSN : 2477-4898.
- Miarso, Yusufhadi. *Menyemai Benih Tekonologi Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Prenada Media Group, 2004.
- Mudhoffir. *Teknologi Instruksional*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 1993.
- Nurdin. *Hubungan Motivasi Belajar Terhadap Prestasi Belajar Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan*. Jurnal: Faktor Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan Vol. II No. 2 Juli 2015.
- Nurfiatin, Titin., Sunarto., dan Sudarno. *Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Kolaboratif Disertai Strategi Quantum Teaching Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa Kelas X PM 1 SMK Negeri 6 Surakarta Tahun Ajaran 2015-2016*. Jurnal: Pendidikan Ekonomi, Universitas Sebelas Maret Surakarta.
- Rofiq, Zainur., Widodo, Urip. dan Fajartanni, Dandhi. *Pengembangan Model Pembelajaran Kolaboratif Untuk Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Gambar Teknik Di Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan*. Jurnal: Pendidikan Teknologi dan Kejuruan, Volume 22, Nomor 2, Oktober 2014

- Rohani, Ahmad dan Ahmadi, Abu. *Pengelolaan Pengajaran*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2005.
- Roqoiyah, Tatik. *Meningkatkan Prestasi Belajar Pendidikan Agama Islam Melalui Model Pembelajaran Kolaborasi*. Jurnal: Wahana Pedagogika, Vol. 2 No. 1 Juni 2016.
- Santoso, Singgih. *Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran Kolaboratif Dan Motivasi Belajar Terhadap Peningkatan Hasil Belajar Fisika Siswa Kelas X SMA Negeri 1 Purwantoro Wonogiri, Jawa Tengah*. Jurnal: Berkala Fisika Indonesia Vo. 5 Nomor 1 Januari 2013.
- Sardiman, AM. *Motivasi Belajar Mengajar*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada, 2010.
- Seels, Barbara. dan Richey, Rita. C. *Instructional Technology, The Defenition and Domains of The Field*, Washington. Terjemahan. Yusufhadi Miarso dkk, 1994.
- Slameto, *Belajar dan Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhinya*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2005.
- Sudjana, Nana. *Dasar-Dasar Proses Belajar Mengajar*. Jakarta; Sinar Baru Algensindo, 2002.
- Sulistyo, Ignatius. *Peningkatan Motivasi Belajar Dengan Menerapkan Model Pembelajaran Kooperatif TGT Pada Pembelajaran Kooperatif TGT Pada Pelajaran PKn*. Jurnal: Studi Sosial Vol 4, No 1 2016.
- Sunadi, Lukman. *Pengaruh Motivasi Belajar Dan Pemanfaatan Fasilitas Belajar Terhadap Prestasi Belajar Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran Ekonomi Kelas XI IPS Di SMA Muhammadiyah 2 Surabaya*. Jurnal: Pendidikan Ekonomi, 2015.
- Suparman, M. Atwi. *Desain Instruksional Modern. Panduan Para Penajar Dan Inovator Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Erlangga, 2012.
- Wardiman, Jojohadikusomo. *Menatap Masa Depan Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Gramedia, 2001.
- Warti, Elis. *Pengaruh Motivasi Belajar Siswa terhadap Hasil Belajar Matematika Siswa di SD Angkasa 10 Halim Perdana Kusuma Jakarta Timur*. Jurnal: Mosharafa, Pendidikan Matematika STKIP Garut, Volume 8, Nomor 3, April 2016.
- Wena, Made. *Strategi Pembelajaran Inovatif Kontemporer*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2009.
- Winkel, W.S. *Psikologi Pengajaran*. Yogyakarta: Media Abadi, 2009.
- Yenni, Agustina. *Perbandingan Hasil Belajar Siswa Yang Diajarkan Dengan Menggunakan Model Pembelajaran Kolaborasi Dan Quantum Teaching Pada Materi Pajak Siswa Kelas VIII SMPN 1 Makmur*. Jurnal: Sains Ekonomi dan Edukasi Vol. III, No. 1 April 2015 ISSN : 2354-6719.
- Zulhafizh, Atmazaki, dan Syahrul R. *Kontribusi Sikap Dan Motivasi Belajar Siswa Terhadap Haisl Belajar Bahasa Indonesia*. Jurnal: Bahasa, Sastra dan Pembelajaran Volume 1 Nomor 2, Juni 2013.